

# Gender Responsive Budgeting in Rajasthan

Some suggestions for consideration for the  
Working Group on Gender Budgeting  
December 26, 2012

Nesar Ahmad



**Budget Analysis Rajasthan Centre**  
[www.barcjaipur.org](http://www.barcjaipur.org)

# Budget Analysis Rajasthan Centre

- Started in 2002, after a study conducted by Astha to understand the impact of globalization on the poor in Rajasthan
- The Major objectives include:
  - Working as a resource centre for the people's organisations and NGOs in the state
  - Budget analysis and policy research and Advocacy
  - Information dissemination for awareness and advocacy

# Budget

*Budget Links Policy to People and People to Policy*

- Budget is a statement of estimated income and expenditure of a government (or any organisation/individual) during a given period (financial year)
- It reflects government's priorities through resource allocation.

# What is Gender Budgeting?

Not a separate budget for women;

- Rather, gender budgets are an attempt to assess government priorities as they are reflected through the budget and examine how they impact women and men and within that, certain groups of women and men.
- They not look at whether or not the same is spent on men and women but rather at what the impact of the spending is on men and women and whether or not budgets respond to the needs of both women and men adequately.

# And So.....

- “Women’s budgets”, “gender budgets”, “gender-sensitive budgets”, and “gender responsive budgets” are all terms that are used to describe initiatives that have used gender as lens from which to analyze budgets at national, regional, and civic levels.

# Gender Responsive Budget

- A gender responsive budget is a budget that acknowledges the gender patterns in society and allocates money to implement policies and programmes that will change these patterns in a way that moves towards a more gender and equal society.
- And, mere a gender budget statement is not necessarily a gender responsive budget

# Why do gender budget?

The most obvious need for gender budget initiatives is-

- Improving women's economic equality;
- Improving effectiveness, efficiency, accountability, and transparency of government budgets;
- Revealing discrepancies between what a government says it is doing and the actual impact of government policies.

# Who does gender budget?

*It is important for both people within and outside government to be involved in gender budgeting work*

- People inside governments can work to implement gender policies in the budget process;
- Activists and researchers from the broader community can push governments to consider the importance and benefits of gender equality;
- Community members can also encourage governments to make more gender-specific data available to them

# Key Players in gender budget

To plan, prepare, execute and evaluate GRB, there is crucial role of-

- Elected representatives
- Civil servants/administrators,
- Gender budget cells in the ministries and departments of state and central government and
- Panchayat and Urban local bodies
- Consistent monitoring by women's bodies, and civil society organisations

# Origin of Gender Budget

- Australia was the first country to implement a women's budget in 1984.
- South Africa's Women's Budget Initiative was initiated in 1995 and involves NGOs, parliamentarians, and a wide range of researchers and advisors.
- Gender budget initiatives in Tanzania(1997) and Uganda(1999) examine the impacts of structural adjustment programs on women in these countries and specifically focus on education and health.
- Since 1995 there have been gender budget initiatives in more than 80 countries around the world.

# Five Stages of Gender Responsive Budgeting

The Five-Step Framework of GRB lists the following 5 steps:

- Step 1: Analysis of the situation of women, men, girls and boys in a given sector;
- Step 2: Assessment of the extent to which policies address the gendered situation;
- Step 3: Assessment as to whether budget allocations are adequate, in order to implement gender responsive policies;
- Step 4: Assessment of short-term outputs of expenditure, in order to evaluate how resources are actually spent, and policies and programmes implemented;
- Step 5: Assessment of the long-term outcomes or impact expenditures might have

(Budlender et al 2002, Gender Budget Makes Cents).

# Pre-requisites for GRB

- Gender sensitization of government and non-government stakeholders
- Orientation of concepts and tools of GRB
- Availability of gender relevant, sex segregated data

# Gender Budget in India

*Many organisations have been analyzing the government budget from a gender perspective*

- WCP introduced in Ninth Five Year Plan (1997-2002)
- Expert Group on “Classification System of Government Transaction” (2003) called for the budget data to be presented in a manner that the gender sensitivities of the budgetary allocations of the line ministries/departments is clearly highlighted and prescribed the norms for the ministries/departments to report the gender budget (GoI, 2004, Report of Ashok Lahiri Committee)

## ....continued....

- Subsequently, in 2004 the MWCD adopted Budgeting for Gender Equity as mission statement
- A strategic framework of activities was framed and disseminated to all the ministries and departments of GoI
- Same year, the MoF issued charter, followed by the recommendation of the Ashok Lahiri Committee, to create GBCs in all ministries/departments
- The GBCs were envisaged as focal point to mainstream gender through GRB

So far, 56 ministries have created GBCs out of which less than five are active

# Gender Budget Statements

- And finally, the union government first time came out with a gender budget statement in 2005-06
- Gender budget statement presents programmes with 100% provisions for women (Part A) and with at least 30% provisions for women (Part B)
- In the GBS 2012-13, gender budget was reported for 33 demands for grants out of total 106.
- According to the latest gender budget statement (2012-13) the union governments total allocation to the programmes benefiting women is 5.9% of the total budget

Later on the concept of GRB has also been extended to performance and outcome budget.

# Some problems with current GBS of Union Govt.

- Schemes reported in part A include even those schemes which do not have 100 women beneficiaries (e.g. IAY)
- Many schemes reported in Part B claim to have 100 women beneficiaries which is not true or logical (e.g. Mins. of Minority Affairs, Earth Sceinces, Labour and Employment etc.)
- In many cases in Part B, there is no clarity on how the ministries determined the percentage of women beneficiaries (e.g. NCPUCL)

# Some other challenges

- Limits of disaggregating allocations by sex of benefiter (laundry/washing uniforms of women staff, contract employment to women)
  - Should also focus on objectives of the expenditure
- GBS' contribution to policy making!!
- Other GRB tools
  - GBS
  - Gender disaggregated revenue analysis
  - Gender aware policy appraisal
  - Gender aware beneficiary survey
  - Time use survey

# Other Strategies to strengthen GRB

- Capacity development and knowledge building by MWCD
- Training Manual by MWCD in 2008, and
- Several training initiatives by MWCD
- Several state governments, including Rajasthan, also engaging in GRB
- At districts levels also some efforts have been made to make Gender Sub Plans

# Gender Budget in Rajasthan

- Rajasthan government presented a gender budget analysis of its 6 departments, including the revenue department, in 2005-06 and again for eight departments in 2006-07
- A gender cell was created in the department of women and child development in 2009
- A high level committee led by the Chief Secretary was constituted in 2010
- GRB mentioned in the Budget Circular issued by the govt. in August 2011 for the budget 2012-13

# Rajasthan - Gender Budget Statement 2012-13

- Programmes given rank according to the percentage of women beneficiaries

Category	Percentage of women beneficiaries
A	> 70%
B	70 - 30%
C	30 -10%
D	< 10 %

- The ranks, however, are given to the schemes/programmes not as whole but separately to the plan, non-plan and CSS components of the schemes/programmes .

# Schemes categorized according to the gender budget component

	A	B	C	D	Total
<b>Non-Plan</b>	28	145	17	38	228
<b>Percent</b>	12.28	63.60	7.45	16.66	100
<b>Plan</b>	61	318	136	82	597
<b>Percent</b>	10.21	53.26	22.78	13.73	100
<b>CSS</b>	11	39	22	11	83
<b>Percent</b>	13.25	46.98	26.50	13.25	100

**Source:** based on BARC's analysis of GBS in 2012-13 budget of Rajasthan

# Analysis of GBS 2012-13

- According to the gender budget statement, about one third of the programmes/schemes have less than 30% women beneficiaries
- Only about 13% of the schemes have more than 70% women beneficiaries
- Rest have women beneficiaries between 30-70%
- In terms of allocation of resources the GBS reports that 19% of the total non-plan, 33% of the total plan and 51% of the total CSS are gender component in the schemes/programmes reported in the GBS.

# Problems with the GBS in State Budget 2012-13

- The information is provided neither department wise nor major head wise, but Budget Finalization Committee (BFC) unit wise.
- We don't know how many BFC units are there in any given department and so nothing can be said about a department with any certainty.
- The schemes/programmes are not give rank as a whole but the plan, non-plan and CSS parts of the schemes/programmes are given ranks.
- So there is no way to say anything about any scheme with some certainty.
- Basis of the rank given are not explained anywhere.

- Assuming that the rank is given on the basis of percentage of women beneficiaries is also problematic.
- E.g. the women component in the budget for three electricity distribution companies have been reported to be 40%. Which can only be assumption.
- The money being allocated to PRIs is has been given rank 'B', showing 43-48% as gender component. This money, however, will be spent by PRIs and its not understandable how the govt. has arrived at the beneficiaries share in those schemes.
- Its not clear if there is sex segregated data of beneficiaries available for all the schemes
- Whether the percent of women beneficiaries shown in the GBS are for previous year (2011-12) or for the budget year (2012-13) is also not clear
- No explanatory notes given about the GBS methods, meaning etc. anywhere in the budget document

# Some Suggestions

## **Some general issues:**

- Women have both reproductive and production roles
- Therefore all three services: general, social and economic services of the govt. become important for them
- It is important to realize and women is not a homogenous category – age, class, caste, marital status
- The objective of the gender responsive budgeting (GRB) is to make all the schemes gender responsive and not just implementing the women development/welfare schemes
- For example: women and agriculture, women and health, women and land revenue etc.

# Some Suggestions

- The GBS should be provided department wise and/or major head wise
- The rank should be given to the scheme as a whole and not to the components of the scheme
- The sex segregated data on beneficiaries should be collected and be made basis of ranks being given.
- The GBS should lead to some clear policy suggestions e.g. is there a need to increase the allocation in certain scheme or there is need to redesign a scheme.
- Category B has a long range (30-70%). It can be split into two categories to provide a better picture

- **Creation of Gender Cell/Desk:** All the departments may create a gender cell/desk to
  - study the gender gaps in their schemes
  - suggest the measures to make the department's scheme further gender responsive
  - suggest ways to collect gender segregated data
  - prepare the GBS for the department
  - envisage new schemes, if needed
- Capacity building of the personnel working on gender budgeting / gender desk
- All the departments should add a chapter in their annual report about the gender responsiveness of their schemes/programmes

- A latest circular issued by the Chief Secretary mentions **‘Gender Neutral Sectors’**
- The so called gender neutral schemes/programmes should be assessed to see their gender responsiveness. For example...
  - Town planning /urban development can include measures to make cities gender friendly – e.g. creating public facilities for women
  - The infrastructure projects can be assessed on the basis of ratio of women in employment generated in those projects and work conditions in their construction
  - Home department can provide training to police personnel on gender sensitization and crime against women
- For some schemes objective of the expenditure may also become basis of the GBS – e.g. to provide training on gender issues to male police personnel
- It is important to keep the number of gender neutral programmes very limited

# Revenue Departments

- Land revenue and other departments should also assess the gender impacts of their policies
- For example is the land policy in the state encourages ownership of property for the women – should not there be joint patta for all married males owning land!
- Is there a way to protect the land rights of widow and single women
- Other form of revenues, for example user charges: are they discouraging women users!

Thanks