

Budget Analysis Rajasthan Centre

An Annual Activity Report

April 2009 – March 2010



Budget Analysis Rajasthan Centre

P-Tilak Marg, C-Scheme,

Jaipur – 302 001

Rajasthan

Phone: +91-141-238 5254

Email: info@barcjaipur.org

Website: www.barcjaipur.org

Background

Budget Analysis Rajasthan Centre (BARC), Jaipur, a programme of Astha, Udaipur, was set-up in 2003 as a budget study and resource centre with the over all aim to analyze the state government budget to understand its policies and see if the commitments made by the government at various forums (policy documents, election manifestos, and at international forums) are matched by the financial provisions in the state budget.

Increasing hardship of the people, particularly of the poor people, in face of economic liberalization has been confirmed by many studies, including one conducted by Ashta, itself. One of the roles of civil society organizations in this scenario is to ensure that the governments do not withdraw from the social sector and the development schemes meant for the poor people. And budget analysis is the best way to keep an eye on the allocations made to various schemes and programmes meant for poor and marginalized in the society.

BARC, therefore, has been involved in analyzing the state budget with a perspective of poor and marginalized and has been using its analysis to further the issues and concerns raised by many civil society organizations by highlighting the short comings in the budget for the poorer sections, for dalits and tribals and women and children and for the important social services like, health and education, social security schemes for widows, for elderly, for unorganized workers etc.

One major role of BARC has been to work as a **resource centre** for the NGOs, POs, media and civil society as a large. We have provided data, analysis, training and resources in training workshops to many organizations across the state, and in some cases, even outside the state of Rajasthan.

Core Objectives of BARC

With the above background, BARC today works with following objectives:

- To bring about the changes in budget and policies of the government of Rajasthan which affect poor men and women in the state, in both urban and rural areas.
- To facilitate public discourses on budget governance issues, encouraged citizen's participation in budget governance, and advance the rights of those most deprived.
- To advocate for a pro-people, pro-poor and pro-marginalized perspective in budget allocations.
- To demystify the budget by making it and the other budget related documents, transparent, user friendly and readable by the public.
- To examine budget spending trends and impact of budget policies on the poor.
- To bring about awareness in the social society organizations on how the budget analysis could be used to change the policies/programmes and budget allocations as well.

- To help civil society organizations to learn how to strengthen their advocacy and lobbying work by using budget data

Core areas:

- **Women/gender Rights:**
- **Dalit and Tribal rights:**
- **Child rights:**
- **Social Sector: Education, Health, Water and sanitation**
- **Agriculture and allied activities**
- **Food security**

During the last one year the Centre has focused on the above mentioned issue through its various activities in research and advocacy.

Mid Term Evaluation of State XI Five Year Plan:

Year 2009-10 was the mid year for the XI Five Year Plan (2007-12) and we decided to evaluate the performance of the XI Five Year Plan (2007-12) in the state of Rajasthan. BARC team analyzed the Plan performance based on the data provided by the Planning Department, GoR and other government documents/publication. The findings suggest that while the financial targets of the Plan were achieved, almost 100%, during the first two years of the XI Plan, and also quite during the third year (2009-10) according the latest available figures, the development achievements during the Plan period were nowhere close to the targets set.

The State Eleventh Five Year Plan (2007-12) sets commendable targets not just in terms of infrastructure but also in terms of the human development indicators such as

- bringing down the Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) and Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR)
- improving nutritional levels for women and children
- improving literacy rates for men and women
- bringing down the drop-out rates of school children
- narrowing the gender gap in education

However, by the end of the third year we are no where closer meeting these targets (to be achieved in five years of the Plan period) when:

- Only 31 Community Health Centers (CHCs) have been built in three years compared to the goal of building 138 CHCs in Plan period
- Only 55 Primary Health Centers (PHCs) have been built in the state during the first three years compared to the goal of building 255 PHCs in Plan period
- In 2008 the IMR in the state was 63 compared to the target of 32 by 2012
- In 2009 MMR was 388 compared to the target of 148 in 2012.
- Similarly, percentage of institutional delivery came up to just 45 percent against the target of increasing it to 70 percent during the Plan's period.

Dalit and Tribal Rights: Under-spending in TSP and SC-SP

Another issue, related to the Five Years Plan (and annual Plans), which BARC has been raising, is about the less allocations (and spending) under Sub Plans for SCs and STs. The Planning Commission of India has issued guidelines to the Ministries of the Union government and the all the State governments and Union Territories to make sure that the Plan amount is allocated for the development of SCs and STs in proportion to their share in the total population of the state. These are known as Tribal Sub Plan (TSP) for Tribals (or STs) and Scheduled Caste Sub Plan (SC-SP) for SCs. The state governments in most of the cases have not been allocating the proportionate amounts as the norms required them to do.

For example, share of tribal communities in the state of Rajasthan is 12% and that of SCs is 17%. The allocations, there for, should be 12% of total Plan allocation to TSP and 17% of the total Plan allocations to SC-SP. But if we track these allocations in the state budget books, the government is allocating not more than 4-5% of total state Plan to TSP and less than 2% to SC-SP. All the departments in the state are supposed to open special Minor Heads for these two sub Plans, which many of them have not yet done. Our analysis is based on the allocations made under these special Minor Heads. The state Planning department, however, claims that the expenditures are at par with the norms. The reason for their claims is assumption made by the various departments that the expenditures made by them are automatically reaching to the tribals and scheduled caste people.

BARC's Response to the State Budget: Advocacy with the Members of Legislative Assembly (MLAs)

During 2009-10 the budget was presented twice in the state assembly and both times the BARC team responded to the budget and worked with select MLAs to raise relevant issues during the budget session.

The state of Rajasthan saw a regime change during the year being reported here, and the earlier BJP govt. was voted out of power and replaced by the Congress govt. The state govt. after being elected in power presented an interim budget (vote for account) was presented in February 2009. The state govt. presented a modified budget in July 2009 for the financial year 2009-10. BARC responded to the state budget at both the occasions. We analyzed over all state budget data as well as department wise budget and the budget for various social groups.

The state government presented its annual budget for 2010-2011 on March 9, 2010 to the state Legislative Assembly. BARC provided its analysis of the state budget to a leading newspaper in the state, which published it the very next day. In the coming days BARC prepared sector wise analytical reports of the analysis of the state budget. BARC has been approached by some MLAs for their analysis of the budget data. BARC's sectoral analysis data has been used by MLAs to inform the debate in the Assembly on department wise Demands for Grants (i.e. department wise budgets).

For example, the government earlier changed the eligibility criteria for the villages where Sambal Gram Yojna¹ could be implemented from 50% of the SC population to 40% and thus increased in the number of villages where this important programme could be implemented, from 2463 to 4110 villages. But in the budget 2010-2011, the government allocated enough money only for 80 villages (same as the last year) which is just for 2 percent of the total eligible villages. Sambal Gram Yojna is being implemented in the villages where more than 40 percent of the population belongs to Scheduled Castes² to increase the infrastructural facilities in those villages. This issue was highlighted by BARC and used by MLAs in the budget discussion in the Legislative Assembly.

Also, the issue of under-spending under **Tribal Sub-Plan and Scheduled Caste Sub-Plan** (as discussed above) has been raised repeatedly. This year the less allocation and spending under these sub-plans meant for upliftment of the these marginalized sections, lack of clear accounting pattern in the budget books and non-opening of the Minor Heads meant for these two sub-plans were highlighted by us and raised in the Legislative Assembly by an MLA. In response, the government promised that next year onwards all the departments would have opened these Minor Heads and better data will be available.

Both the above issues were raised in the Legislative Assembly by an opposition party MLA, named Rao Rajendra Singh, based on the data and analysis provided by BARC. The efforts made by BARC in collaboration with other NGOs/people's organizations by making our analysis available to the media, civil society organizations and the elected representatives have yielded in increased focus on relevant issues in budget discussions in the Legislative Assembly. The promise of opening Minor Heads for TSP and SC-SP in all the departments, if fulfilled, will help us in having better information about the allocations and expenditure made under these two sub Plans which will open the ways for further effective advocacy for raising the level of allocation and expenditure under the two sub-Plans.

Other Achievements:

BARC continued with its other activities like issues based meetings and regional meetings, conducting micro research and publishing booklets and our Hindi newsletter, Budget Samachar (See the Table 1). BARC conducted three issue based meetings (on Unorganized Workers, Gender Budget and Minor Forest Produces) and 2 regional level workshops (one focusing on Panchayat Budget and Planning) during the year, in various parts of the state.

We continued with publishing Budget Samachar, our Hindi newsletter, which reaches to more that 1000 individuals/organization in the state and outside. This year we also printed

¹ Sambal Gram Yojna is a programme to increase infrastructural facilities in the villages with high percentage of SC population.

² Scheduled Caste people, also known as dalits, at the lowest rank in the Hindu caste system, are identified as one of the groups by the Indian Constitution for whose development and welfare, the government (s) can take special measures.

two booklets in Hindi. One booklet is on "Schemes/Programmes for Dalits in Rajasthan" in collaboration with Dalit Arthik Adhikar Abhiyan (DAAA), Jaipur. The other booklet is on Minor Forest Produces, based on a micro study conducted by BARC in collaboration with Samarthak Samiti, Udaipur.

BARC has been acting as a resource centre and have provided data, analysis and resources to various organizations. We provided data on TSP to the Office of the Supreme Court Commissioner on Food Security in New Delhi and Soochna and Rozgar Abhiyan Rajasthan, among others (Table 2). BARC members provided major resource in workshop organized by CEOEDECON on "Budget Tracking and Monitoring" for their community based organizations. This two days workshop was planned and conducted by BARC members. We also conducted sessions in capacity building workshops, conferences and conventions organized by other organizations like CASA, Udaipur and CDR, Jaipur (Table 1). BARC team members also wrote in various newspapers and magazines on issues related to our core themes during the year.

BARC received visitors from China and Indonesia, on part of a Ford Foundation delegates who visited India to see the budget analysis and advocacy being done by the civil society in India. The group visited a near by Panchayat where many PRI representatives from the neighboring areas and one MLA received the group. We also used this opportunity to take up our work on panchayat budget to interact and learn with the panchayats. Back to Jaipur, the group also learnt our work in detail and also heard from an ex MLA on BARC's role in promoting public debate and discussions on budget.

Besides providing resources and data and analysis to various NGOs and POs, most of our activities have been organized in close collaboration with various NGOs and POs. For example, the Panchayat Budget and Planning workshop was organized with Local Self Governance Unit of Astha, Udaipur, the regional meeting at Sikar was organized in collaboration with a local organization. The issue based meetings were also organized in collaboration with various organizations working on these issues. The micro studies were conducted in collaboration with Samarthak Samiti and other organizations. This year BARC team also collaborated with Astha, Udaipur for their Base Line Survey on Food Security and Right to Food Campaign, Rajasthan for a study on impact of drought. Data have been collected for both these studies we are working on reports for one of these studies, while other is at data analysis stage now.

Thus BARC has continued to work towards its main goal of becoming a resource centre for the people's organisations and NGOs in the state during this year. The larger goal we hoped to achieve with this programme is to support the People's Organizations and NGOs in the state in their advocacy efforts. Our activities during the reporting year have certainly contributed to this larger goal. We have provided vital budget information and data to the organizations have published booklet (on schemes for dalits) which is being widely used by NGOs/ POs.

We have also directly contacted MLAs in the state and have provided them budget data related to the social sectors. The MLAs have used our data and analysis during the discussion on the state budget in the State Legislative Assembly.

Our over all work has contributed in the democratic process in the state by public debate and discussions on the state budget.

Table: 1

Budget Analysis Rajasthan Centre (BARC) Annual Report 2009-10 (April-March)

| Activities | Activities organized/conducted | | | |
|--|--|---|---|--|
| Issue based meetings | Unorganized Workers (Jaipur, May 2009) | Gender budget (Alwar, June 2009) | MFP (Udaipur, December, 2009) | |
| Publication | Schemes for Dalits | MFP Study report | | |
| Budget Samachar | Feb-April 2009 | April-July 2009 | August-October 2009 | |
| Post budget analysis and advocacy | July 2009 | March 2010 | | |
| Regional workshop | Panchayat Budget and Planning (Jaipur, August 2009) | | Sikar (November 2009) | |
| MLA meeting | | | | February 2010 |
| Panchayat Budget | Meetings with sarpanches on panchayat budget (August 2009) | | Ford Delegates Visit to Panchayats (August 2009) | |
| Budget Analysis | Budget Analysis (BARC's day to day work) | Mid Tem Evaluation of State XI Five Year Plan | | |
| Research and micro studies | MFP study: analysis done and report published | Farmers credit study: Analysis completed and report written | Base Line Survey on Food Security (with Astha, report being written) | Impact of Drought 2009 (With Right to Food Campaign, data collected) |
| Guests | Ford foundations delegates visited BARC (August 2009) | | | |
| Meetings as resource persons | Child budget (OTS) | Dalit Women Activists Training (September 2009)(CDR) | CECOEDECON Farmers Committees' members (Budget Tracking, February 2010) | Budget for Right to Food Scheme (CASA, March 2009) |
| Capacity building of BARC Team | Visit to Jaisalmer by BARC team (August 2009) | One day workshop (September 2009) | Communication Workshop (January 2010) | |
| News paper article | July 2009, on Forest Budget | October 2009 Agriculture | March 2010 On State Budget in | |

| | | | | |
|--|--|--|----------------|--|
| | in Dainik Bhaskar | Today On agriculture | Dainik Bhaskar | |
| Meetings attended | Delhi Pre Budget Consultation (CBGA, October 2009) | CBPS, Bangalore (December 2009) | | |
| Data provided to various Organization | Various organizations | | | |

Table: 2

NGOs/POs availing data/information from BARC - 2010

| Organization | Type of data/information | Status | Concerned person |
|--|--|---------------|-------------------------|
| Soochna eym rozgar abhiyan, Rajasthan | Minimum wages for NREGA workers, linking it to inflation | Provided | Hariom |
| Supreme Court Commissioner on Right to Food, New Delhi | Department wise data on TSP for Rajasthan | Provided | Ujithra |
| Vividha, Jaipur | Data on budget for Saharia tribes | Provided | Mamta |